APPLICATION <u>P07/W0838/LB</u>

NO.

APPLICATION LISTED BLDG. CONSENT

TYPE

REGISTERED 18.07.2007

PARISH LITTLE MILTON

WARD Mr John Nowell-Smith

MEMBER(S)

APPLICANT Punch Taverns Ltd

SITE Lamb Inn High Street Little Milton

PROPOSAL Single storey rear extension & associated landscaping. Minor

internal alteration & redecoration.

AMENDMENTS (As amended by Drawing No. 25034/13D accompanying Agent's

letter dated 13 August 2007).

GRID 461867200905

REFERENCE

OFFICER Miss S Bird

APPLICATION P07/W0839

NO.

APPLICATION FULL

TYPE

REGISTERED 23.07.2007

PARISH LITTLE MILTON

WARD Mr John Nowell-Smith

MEMBER(S)

APPLICANT Punch Taverns Ltd

SITE Lamb Inn High Street Little Milton

PROPOSAL Demolition of garage and toilet block. Erection of single storey rear

extension, associated landscaping and extended car park. Internal

alteration & redecoration works to existing building.

AMENDMENTS (As amended by Drawing No. 25034/13D accompanying Agent's

letter dated 13 August 2007).

GRID 461867200905

REFERENCE

OFFICER Miss S Bird

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 These applications are referred to the Planning Committee because the recommendation conflicts with the views of the Little Milton Parish Council.

- 1.2 The Lamb Inn is a late 16th century Grade II listed public house which lies in a prominent location in the Little Milton Conservation Area. It is a narrow-span building with thatched roof and limestone rubble walls with some timber framing. There are two curtilage listed outbuildings to the rear of the Inn, one of which is currently used to provide toilet facilities for the main pub use. The site also lies within the Oxford Green Belt.
- 1.3 An ordnance survey extract showing the location of the site is **attached** at Appendix 1.
- 1.4 A copy of the building's listing and photograph are **attached** at Appendix 2.

2.0 PROPOSAL

- 2.1 The applications seek permission for the demolition of the two curtilage listed outbuildings and the erection of a rear extension. Internal alterations, redecoration of the existing building, associated landscaping and extension of the car park area are also proposed.
- 2.2 The application plans are <u>attached</u> at Appendix 3. A copy of the applicant's justification and Design and Access statement submitted as part of the application are also <u>attached</u>. You are advised that despite reference within the statement to natural grey slate roof tiles in the statement, clay roof tiles are actually proposed and shown on the accompanying plans.

3.0 CONSULTATIONS & REPRESENTATIONS

3.1 **Little Milton Parish Council** – Considers that the application should be approved because their previous concerns regarding materials have been addressed.

Conservation Officer – Strongly objects to the proposals on the grounds that they would neither preserve nor enhance the character of the Conservation Area and would be harmful to the special historical and architectural qualities of the listed building. Recommends refusal. A full copy of the Conservation Officer's report is **attached** at Appendix 4.

Forestry Officer – The proposed works are likely to impact upon adjacent trees, but which are reaching the end of useful life expectancy and are not particularly visible from public vantage points. As the trees lie outside of the site area, a condition should require a Method Statement detailing how the works can be carried out without adversely affecting their longevity.

Environmental Health Officer – Has recommended conditions relating to kitchen extraction noise and odour control and external lighting to protect the amenity of nearby residential properties and businesses.

OCC Highways – No objection subject to condition requiring parking and manoeuvring areas to be provided as shown.

OCC Archaeology – No observations.

English Heritage – Advised that the scheme does not fall within the statutory provisions of Circular 01/2001 under which English Heritage should be notified.

Society for the Protection of Ancient Buildings – Expressed concerns over the scale of the extension which could assume undue importance in relation to the listed building and create an adverse affect on its character and setting.

Neighbour Supporters (2) – The neighbouring property and a group of local residents referring to themselves as the 'Little Milton Chamber of Commerce' wrote in support of the application on the grounds that pub forms a valuable social focus in the village.

4.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

4.1 **P07/W0054 and P07/W0065/LB** – Removal of garage and external WC block. Form new rear extension and patio – **Withdrawn** prior to determination April 2007.

This scheme was of a similar scale and form to that currently proposed and was withdrawn on the basis of significant concerns relating to impact on the Listed Building.

4.2 **P06/W0846 and P06/W0848/LB** – Removal of garage and external WC block. Form new rear extension to include new wc's, trade space, entrance lobby and courtyard area – **Withdrawn** prior to determination September 2006.

This scheme proposed a rear extension to be oriented in the opposite direction to that currently proposed and was withdrawn on the basis of significant concerns relating to impact on the Listed Building.

4.3 Officers have been involved in ongoing discussions with the applicant and agent since the 2006 applications, during which Officers have consistently raised issues relating to the harm that would be caused to the historic fabric and to the character and setting of the listed building associated with a scheme of this scale and form.

5.0 POLICY & GUIDANCE

5.1 Adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011 Policies:

- G2 Protection and Enhancement of the Environment
- G6 Promoting Good Design
- D1 Good Design and Local Distinctiveness
- GB2 New Buildings in the Green Belt
- GB4 Visual Amenity in the Green Belt
- CF2 Provision of Community Facilities and Services
- CON1 Demolition of Listed Buildings
- CON2 Alterations and Extensions to Listed Buildings
- CON3 Alterations and Extensions to Listed Buildings
- CON5 The Setting of Listed Buildings
- CON6 Proposals Affecting a Conservation Area
- CON7 Proposals Affecting a Conservation Area
- T1 Transport Requirements for New Developments
- T2 Transport Requirements for New Developments

National Planning Guidance:

PPG15 – Planning and the Historic Environment

6.0 PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS

- 6.1 The only consideration in the application for listed building consent (P07/W0838/LB) is:
 - 1. Impact on the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building.

6.2 Impact on the Listed Building

The Lamb Inn is a modest public house dating from the late 16th Century. The existing thatched building has a simple rectangular plan form, typical of vernacular buildings found in the area dating from the 16th and 17th centuries, and survives largely intact. Two modest outbuildings survive to the rear. They are of

- traditional construction, in a similar stone to match the principal listed building and English Heritage has highlighted, in previous correspondence on the 2006 applications, that they are likely to be of considerable interest given the age of the building and its location in a prominent position on the High Street.
- 6.3 The application proposes the demolition of these two outbuildings in order to allow for the extension of the current pub. This extension would enable the existing wc's to be incorporated within the main building, rather than in a separate block as is currently the case. However, the main justification put forward for the extension appears to be the fact that the pub is no longer economically viable. No financial information has been provided to back up this statement or in relation to how the required additional area has been calculated. Having regard to this and the proposed scheme, officers consider that the applicant has not made sufficient case for demolishing the two curtilage listed outbuildings on the site.
- 6.4 Planning Policies CF1, CF2 and CF3 support the retention of an operational public house as an important community facility within Little Milton and your officers are therefore prepared to accept the demolition of these curtilage listed outbuildings and an extension to the pub in principle **on the proviso** that a well designed and sympathetic scheme of an appropriate scale is put forward. The proposed extension and associated landscaping are not considered to represent an improvement of the site or to show a careful design approach which takes into account the importance of the listed building and as such, the proposed scheme does not justify the loss of the two curtilage listed buildings.
- 6.5 The Conservation Officer's comments comprehensively detail the issues and concerns relating to the current scheme and are attached to this report. Alongside numerous issues associated with the proposed internal works and alterations, which do not take into account the historic significance of the building and its construction, the overall scale and design of the extension relates extremely poorly to the established character and appearance of the listed building. The excessively wide, open plan extension would be at odds with the narrow, cellular spaces characteristic of the main listed building and informs an external design and choice of materials which lack cohesion and bear no relationship to the form, proportions or appearance of the principal building. A large proportion of the rear elevation of the principal building itself would be obscured by the width of the proposed extension and the choice of landscaping materials and design would further detract from the setting of the listed building. Furthermore, little consideration has been given to the incorporation of associated services that will be required, such as extractor fans and flues, such that they have been unsympathetically tacked-on or left for a later date, which is likely to damage the character and appearance of the listed building further still.
- 6.6 As such, the proposal would be damaging to the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building and would be harmful to its setting, contrary to both local and national policy guidance.
- 6.7 The main considerations in the application for planning permission (P07/W0839) are:
 - 1. Impact on the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building and its setting within the Little Milton Conservation Area;
 - 2. Impact on the openness of the surrounding Green Belt;
 - 3. Impact on residential amenity; and,

4. Impact on highway safety.

Impact on the Listed Building and its Setting within the Conservation Area

As detailed above, the overall scale and design of the proposed extension relates extremely poorly to the established character and appearance of this Grade II listed building. The excessively wide, open plan extension would be at odds with the narrow, cellular spaces characteristic of the main listed building and informs an external design and choice of materials which lack cohesion and bear no relationship to the form, proportions or appearance of the principal building. A large proportion of the rear elevation of the principal building itself would be obscured by the width of the proposed extension and the choice of landscaping materials and design would further detract from the setting of the listed building.

6.9 Your officers would be supportive of a well designed and sympathetic scheme of appropriate size for the extension of this pub. However, as the proposals stand, the scheme would be damaging to the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building and would be harmful to its setting, failing to either preserve of enhance the character or appearance of the Little Milton Conservation Area, contrary to both local and national policy guidance.

Impact on the Green Belt

6.10

6.8

National policy guidance on Green Belts makes no provision for this kind of development. However, The Lamb is considered to lie within the built up limits of Little Milton and is located adjacent to development which projects beyond the rear building line of the proposed extension. As such, the extension is unlikely to have a material impact on the openness of the Green Belt. The hardstanding which forms the car park is also proposed to be extended towards the rear of the site. Given the fact that this would be low lying and that the site is screened along its rear and side boundaries, this would not result in a materially greater impact on the openness of the Green Belt than is currently the situation.

Impact on Residential Amenity

6.11

The site has an established use as a public house. The proposed extension would be some distance from residential neighbours and the site boundary treatments would screen immediate neighbours from overlooking or overshadowing. According to the information submitted by the applicants, the extension should allow for 22 additional covers. The Council's Environmental Health team has stipulated conditions to control kitchen extraction noise and odour control and external lighting in order to protect the occupants of nearby residential properties and businesses from increased disturbance.

Impact on Highway Safety

6.12

The proposed extension will affect some of the site's existing off-street parking area. However, the plans show that the parking area would be extended to replace part of that area lost. Whilst a large part of the extension would provide associated service areas such as a cellar and increased servery area, in terms of floor space increase, there is only around a 70sqm increase to the A3 restaurant use. Consequently, although the existing vehicle access serving the Lamb Inn does not meet the required visibility standards, the Local Highway Authority

cannot justify recommending refusal on highway safety grounds. The Highway Authority has therefore recommended that parking and manoeuvring areas are conditioned to ensure construction and completion prior to first use of the accommodation.

7.0 CONCLUSION

7.1 It is recommended that planning permission and listed building consent be refused because the proposal would be damaging to the special architectural and historic interest of the listed building and would be harmful to its setting, failing to either preserve of enhance the character or appearance of the Little Milton Conservation Area As such, the proposal is contrary to both local and national policy guidance.

8.0 RECOMMENDATION

- 8.1 That listed building consent be refused under P07/W0838/LB for the following reasons:
 - 1. That, having regard to the scale, form, design and materials of the proposed extension and external patio area, the proposals would relate poorly to the form, proportions and appearance of the principal Grade II listed building and would seriously harm its special architectural and historic character. As such, the proposal would be contrary to the provisions of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, particularly policies G2, G6, D1, CON2, CON3, CON5 and CON7, and to Government guidance contained within PPG15 'Planning and the Historic Environment'.
 - 2. That the proposed internal alterations fail to take account of the historic significance of the building and its construction. As such, the proposal would be harmful to the special architectural and historic interest of the Grade II listed building contrary to the provisions of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, particularly policies G6 and CON3, and to Government guidance contained within PPG15 'Planning and the Historic Environment'.
 - 3. That, in the absence of an acceptable scheme for redevelopment of the site, insufficient justification has been made for the demolition of the curtilage listed outbuildings. As such, the proposals would be harmful to the special architectural and historic interest of the Grade II listed building contrary to the provisions of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, particularly policies CON1 and CON6, and to Government guidance contained within PPG15 'Planning and the Historic Environment'.

- 4. That insufficient details have been submitted to ensure that the proposed kitchen, toilet and heating services, particularly extractor fans, flues and drainage runs, would not be detrimental to the special architectural and historic interest of the Grade II listed building. As such, the proposal would be contrary to the provisions of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, particularly policies CON2 and CON5, and to Government guidance contained within PPG15 'Planning and the Historic Environment'.
- 8.2 That planning permission be refused under P07/W00839 for the following reasons:
 - 1. That, having regard to the scale, form, design and materials of the proposed extension and external patio area, the proposals would relate poorly to the form, proportions and appearance of the principal Grade II listed building and would seriously harm its special architectural and historic character and setting within the Little Milton Conservation Area. As such, the proposal would be contrary to the provisions of the adopted South Oxfordshire Local Plan 2011, particularly policies G2, G6, D1, CON2, CON3, CON5 and CON7, and to Government guidance contained within PPG15 'Planning and the Historic Environment'.

Author: Miss S Bird

Contact No: 01491 823765

Email Add: planning.west@southoxon.gov.uk